

Bill Carnazzo  
Spring Creek Flycraft and Guide Service

RECEIVED  
SACRAMENTO  
CVRWQCB

09 FEB 11 PM 1:58

Plt  
WSN

February 9, 2009

Pamela Creedon, Executive Officer  
CVRWQCB  
11020 Sun Center Drive, #200  
Rancho Cordova CA 95670-6114

Re: Draft CAO to El Dorado County for the Rubicon Trail

Dear Ms. Creedon:

I am a fly fishing guide. As part of my business, I take my guests on walk-in fishing trips to fish the Rubicon River from various access points, depending on their skills. Over the nearly 40 years that I have fished this river, I have noticed a marked decline in the quality of the fishery. While I am not a scientist, I have an enormous amount of practical and anecdotal experience on this river on which I base my conclusion. When I use the term "fishery" I include, of course, the fish—in terms of their size and numbers; I also include the population of aquatic insect species upon which the fish depend (mayfly, stonefly, caddis, dragonfly, damselfly) and the general environs of the river. ✓

I understand that the problem is complex, and the fault for the entire problem cannot be laid at the feet of any one type of user.

Nonetheless, it is clear to me that siltation and degraded water quality are at least very significant contributors to the problem. I have witnessed the damage done by those off-roaders whose ethics are questionable. Others have provided pictures that speak more eloquently than words. If you need more, I have them.

I congratulate you and your staff for your willingness to take on this difficult and politically sensitive issue. As owner of the roadway, El Dorado County is clearly legally responsible for the environmental damage caused by its failure to supervise the use of the road and associated trails by off-roaders. Degraded water quality, of course, is one form of the associated damage to the Rubicon.

To me, as a citizen, it seems incredulous that the Board of Supervisors unceremoniously trashed the management plan and DEIR with its recommended mitigation measures, including the user fees that would have made the plan self-supporting.

In order to address the County's lack of will to assume the task of implementing the management plan and impose the necessary user fees, it seems to me that the CAO is a reasonable and necessary method to achieve legal compliance and, ultimately, environmental justice. It is appalling that one small segment of our society—viz., off-road users—is allowed to cause wanton destruction at will, of a once-pristine treasure that we and those who follow us in time have the right to enjoy. You, and the County as well, are charged with protection of the Public Trust. It is time to impose the reasonable solution that you and your staff have formulated in the CAO.

Once again, thank you for your diligence.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to be "Bill [unclear]", written over the word "Sincerely,".